

My initial cut has always been for funds in the top 25% of their peer group over the last five years, but right now I'd extend that to a decade because the shorter time frame excludes any big downturns. I'm looking for consistency, and I'll sacrifice some upside potential for the promise of a smoother ride.

Step 5: Choose the finalists, read the prospectuses, check with the analysts.

I'm looking for holdings that are consistent with a manager's discipline; examine what a fund is allowed to invest in, which is key to how the portfolio could change over time.

If a fund's ratings from firms like Morningstar, Lipp New Constructs or hers make me question my analysis, I'm moving on. I don't let ratings determine which funds I consider, but I want confirmation or my gut feelings and I'm careful when betting against those experts.

Step 6: Check under the hood.

This is where the shortlist gets weeded to my pick. Lower costs, better tax efficiency (unless the fund is in an IRA), and less overlap with my current holdings tend to be my key tiebreakers.

Step 7: Pick my winner, jot down my thinking and make the purchase.

My file on any new fund starts with a detailed list of factors that led to my decision, making it easier years from now to answer the question "Would I buy it again today?"

If I'm not nervously excited by the potential of my pick, something is wrong. Without that rush, I'd refine the search, start over and keep looking until I find something I believe in.

Copyright © 2014 MarketWatch, Inc. All rights reserved. By using this site, you agree to the Terms of Service, Privacy Policy, and Cookie Policy

Intraday Data provided by SIX Financial Information and subject to terms of use. Historical and current end-of-day data provided by SIX Financial Information. Intraday data delayed per exchange requirements. S&P/Dow Jones Indices (SM) from Dow Jones & Company, Inc. All quotes are in local exchange time. Real time last sale data provided by NASDAQ. More information on NASDAQ traded symbols and their current financial status. Intraday data delayed 15 minutes for Nasdaq, and 20 minutes for other exchanges. S&P/Dow Jones Indices (SM) from Dow Jones & Company, Inc. SEHK intraday data is provided by SIX Financial Information and is at least 60-minutes delayed. All quotes are in local exchange time.